

הלכה ברורה Halacha Berurah

The Halachos of Chanukah

Email Edition

Reviewed by Horav Yisroel Belsky



is interesting to note that, in this context, the *Mishnah Berurah* strays from his typical style of stating factual *halacha* and offers harsh criticism to individuals who play cards on *Chanukah*, instead of occupying themselves with singing *zemiros* and giving praise to the *Ribono Shel Olam*. He writes that the *seforim hakedoshim* heavily protested against such behavior, and whoever guards his soul should distance himself from it.³

Playing *dreidel* does have some significance and historical background and is an accepted custom on *Chanukah*.⁴ A game of *dreidel* is permissible, of course, only when no gambling is involved. This topic is beyond the scope of this discussion.

The Structure of the Mitzvah of Ner Chanukah

The basic *mitzvah* of *ner chanukah* is that a *ner* should be lit outside of every household publicizing the *nes* of *Chanukah*. The *mitzvah* requires that every person take part in the *mitzvah* of *pirsumei nissa* in his *bayis*. According to the basic *mitzvah*, however, only one *menorah* must be lit and the one lighting it can be *motzie* all the members of the *bayis*.

The term "*bayis*" is different in respect to *ner Chanukah* than it is in some other areas of *halacha*. Regarding *ner Chanukah*, "*bayis*" includes one's home as well as one's place of lodging during *Chanukah*. We will demonstrate below that even if a person is not sleeping at home, he can fulfill his *mitzvah* of *hadlaka* at home by having someone light there on his behalf. His home always remains his "*bayis*." Alternatively, one has the option of partaking in the *hadlaka* of his host (which

The Nes of Chanukah

During the time of the second *Bais Hamikdosh*, the Syrian-Greeks issued cruel decrees against *Klal Yisroel* in their attempt to destroy the Jewish religion. The Syrian-Greeks entered the *Bais Hamikdosh*, desecrating and defiling all the pure and holy *keilim* inside.

On the 25th day of *Kislev*, the *Chashmonaim* succeeded in defeating the Syrian-Greek forces occupying *Eretz Yisroel*. The *Chashmonaim* entered the *Bais Hamikdosh* in search of uncontaminated oil to use for the kindling of the *menorah*. After much searching, they found only one bottle of oil that contained the unbroken seal of the *kohen gadol*, attesting to its purity. Although there was only sufficient oil to burn for one day, a miracle occurred and it lasted for eight days, after which they were able to produce more oil. Therefore, on *Chanukah*, we light the *menorah* for eight days to thank *Hashem* and publicize the great miracle that occurred at that time.¹

Celebrating and Feasting on Chanukah

The *poskim* point out a distinction between *Purim* and *Chanukah* with regard to the requirement of feasting and celebrating.

On *Purim*, we celebrate the fact that *Klal Yisroel* was saved from a decree to annihilate the Jewish nation physically.

On *Chanukah*, however, we celebrate the salvation from a decree that sought to destroy *Klal Yisroel* spiritually. Thus, the focus on *Chanukah* is not on feasting but on giving thanks and praise to the *Ribono Shel Olam*.

Still and all, many *poskim* recommend making *seudos* on *Chanukah*. This is done in commemoration of the fact that the workings necessary for the *mishkan* were completed on the 25th day of *Kislev*, although the *mishkan* was not constructed until months later in *Chodesh Nissan*. Additionally, *seudos* are made on *Chanukah* to commemorate the rededication of the *Bais Hamikdosh* which had been defiled by the Syrian-Greeks. However, since these *seudos* are not a bona fide *Yom Yov* requirement, many *poskim* recommend that a person sing *zemiros* (which consist of praise to *Hashem*) during the *seudos*, so that the *seudos* will be considered *seudos mitzvah*. It is proper to speak words of *Torah* at the *seudos* as well.²

The *Maharshal* writes that, on *Chanukah*, a person who has a set time to learn should not spend that time feasting instead. It

Please Note: Due to the intricacy of the material discussed in each issue, and the brevity of its treatment, a *Rov* should be consulted for a final *psak halacha*. In addition, this publication does not intend to be מכריע on issues that are a *machlokes haposkim*. Although we have usually brought the dissenting views in the footnotes, we have selected for simplicity sake to incorporate into the main text the views of the *Mishnah Berurah*, R' Moshe Feinstein, R' Shlomo Zalmen Auerbach and several other preeminent *poskim*. Please send all questions and comments to 1341 E. 23rd Street, Brooklyn, NY 11210 or email to hbinfo@thekosher.net

will be explained below) or lighting a separate *menorah* in his host's home.

If however, one has no *bayis* (e.g. a homeless individual living on the street), he does not have to light the *menorah*. Lighting on the street is not a fulfillment of the *mitzvah*.⁵

The Number of *Neiros* to Kindle

There are three levels at which one can perform the *mitzvah* of lighting *neiros Chanukah*. Lighting one *ner* per household every night fulfills the basic *mitzvah*, as mentioned above. The next level, the *mehadrin* (scrupulous individuals), light one *ner* for each member of the household every night. The third level, the *mehadrin min hamehadrin* (the most meticulous ones), light an additional *ner* for each member of the household each subsequent night.⁶

There is a difference between the *minhag* of the *Ashkenazim* and the *minhag* of the *Sefardim* as to how this last level is performed. The *minhag* of the *Ashkenazim* is for each member of the household to add an additional *ner* each night. The *minhag* of the *Sefardim* is to kindle only one *ner* on the first night - regardless of how many members there are in the family - and continue lighting one additional *ner* on each subsequent night.⁷

It is important to note that those lighting according to the *Ashkenazic* custom should be careful not to place the *menorahs* too close to each other, so that a person observing the *menorahs* from outside the house should be able to discern how many *menorahs* are lit and how many *neiros* have been kindled on each *menorah*.⁸

Women and Girls

The general custom is that married women do not light their own *menorahs*, even though men and women are equally included in this *mitzvah*. A woman fulfills her obligation through her husband's lighting. Only in circumstances where a man cannot light does his wife light on behalf of him, as will be illustrated below. Similarly, a widow (who is not part of any household, e.g. she does not live with her married children) is required to light her own *menorah*.⁹

In most circles, unmarried girls do not light their own *menorahs*, but are included in the lighting of their household (i.e. even if they are away from home).¹⁰

The Proper Time for the Kindling of the *Menorah*

The *Gemara* states that one should light the *menorah* "*mishetishke hachama*," from sunset. There is a dispute among the *Rishonim* whether this refers to the beginning of sunset (i.e. when the disc of the sun sets beneath the horizon) or to the conclusion of sunset - *tzeis*

hakochavim [i.e. when three medium stars appear in the sky (which, in the United States, according to Rav Moshe Feinstein, is approximately 40-50 minutes after the beginning of sunset)].¹¹

In order to fulfill the obligation according to both of the aforementioned views, Rav Moshe Feinstein had the custom to light the *menorah* 10 minutes after the beginning of sunset,¹² while others, such as the *Chazon Ish* and Rav Aharon Kotler, lit the *menorah* 20-25 minutes after the beginning of sunset.¹³ One who lights at these times should place enough oil in the *menorah* for the *neiros* to burn until one half-hour after *tzeis hakochavim*.

Some conduct themselves according to the opinion of the second view in the *Rishonim*, and light the *menorah* around the conclusion of sunset.¹⁴

Davening Maariv First

A problem arises for one who normally *davens Maariv* at *tzeis hakochavim* and wishes to do the same during *Chanukah*, but also wishes to light the *menorah* right after *tzeis hakochavim*. Which one takes precedence?

Maariv has two advantages, since it is *tadir* - it occurs every night - and also contains *Krias Shema*, which is recited *min haTorah*. Although *neiros Chanukah* has the important factor of *pirsumei nissa*, nevertheless, it only occurs eight times a year and is only a *mitzvah derabonon*.

Consequently, the *poskim* maintain that *Maariv* takes precedence. Therefore, the *Mishnah Berurah* advises a person in such a predicament to light the *menorah* shortly before *tzeis hakochavim* - a time when he would not *daven Maariv* - and then, at *tzeis hakochavim*, he should *daven Maariv*. In this manner, the lighting of the *menorah* is not delayed and one avoids the *halachic* issue of which *mitzvah* takes precedence.¹⁵

Contrary to popular belief, most *poskim* maintain that if one regularly *davens Maariv* much later, there is no *halacha* requiring one to *daven Maariv* prior to lighting the *menorah*. The question of which one takes precedence arises only when one plans to perform both *mitzvos* at around the same time.¹⁶

The Latest Time

The *Gemara* states that the latest time that one may light the *menorah* is "*ad shetichleh regel min hashuk*," the time that people cease walking the streets. This time is defined in the *meforshim* as being approximately one half-hour after *tzeis hakochavim*.

The *Gemara* offers two ways to understand the timeslot of "*mishetishke hachama ad shetichleh regel min hashuk*." One understanding, as we explained, is that it informs us of the

latest time one may light the *menorah* to fulfill the *mitzvah*. Another way to understand it is that the *Gemara* is not informing us of *when* we may light the *menorah*, but for *how long* the lights must burn for. From *tzeis hakochavim* until the time of *tichleh regel min hashuk* is approximately one half-hour.¹⁷

Tosafos explain that, according to this second approach, even if one did not light until much later in the evening, he still fulfills his *mitzvah* provided that he puts in enough oil for it to burn for a full half-hour. However, preferably one should light prior to the time of *tichleh regel min hashuk*, since it is questionable which approach is the more authoritative one. However, if one did not light prior to that time, he may still light the *menorah*, as the *Gemara* does offer the other approach.¹⁸

Tosafos then quote the *Ri* who maintains that since in our times people conceal their *menorahs* and light inside their houses due to governmental decrees forbidding the kindling of lights during that time of year except in their houses of worship, and the primary purpose of lighting became to publicize the miracle of *Chanukah* to the members of one's household, one would be permitted to delay lighting the *menorah* until after the time people cease frequenting the streets.¹⁹

The *Rama* rules in accordance with the *Ri*. However, he writes that it is still preferable to light during the time specified in the *Gemara*.

Nowadays, although there are no governmental decrees forbidding the kindling of lights in one's home, the general custom in *chutz laaretz* is to light indoors. However, the custom has remained to light by a window facing the public domain and the main focus of the *mitzvah* is to publicize the *nes* to the multitudes of people passing by one's house on the street. Consequently, the *menorah* should be lit before the time people cease walking the streets. Additionally, there is a concept in *halacha* of *zerizin makdimin l'mitzvos* - the scrupulous ones hasten themselves to the performance of *mitzvos*. Consequently, one should try to light as close to the beginning *zeman* as he can.²⁰

Nonetheless, since the *menorah* is being lit inside, if one could not light earlier in the evening, he can still make a *bracha* if members of his household are still awake since there will be *pirsumei nissa* to the members of the household.²¹ Additionally, a number of *poskim* maintain that the *zeman* of *tichleh regel min hashuk* is dependent on the factors in every locale. Thus, in contemporary urban cities, the time would be much later, perhaps even a bit later than nine or ten o'clock.²²

Therefore, if one's wife won't be home until later at night and she would rather that

one wait to light until she comes home, it is perfectly permitted, and even recommended, that one wait for his wife. The same applies to children waiting for working parents to come home, unless the parents absolutely do not mind if the children go ahead and light without them.²³

There is a famous story about Rav Nochumke, the *rebbe* of the *Chofetz Chaim*. A few *talmidim* were at his home on *Chanukah* and the *zman* to light the *menorah* arrived. Rav Nochumke, however, did not light the *menorah*. They waited and waited, and finally, when Rav Nochumke's wife came home much later at night, he immediately rushed to light the *menorah*.

The *talmidim* were puzzled and asked Rav Nochumke why he didn't light earlier at the preferred time if his wife was automatically going to be *yotze* with his lighting anyway. He responded by citing the *Gemara's* ruling that if a poor person only has enough money to buy either *ner Shabbos* or *ner Chanukah*, he should spend the money on *ner Shabbos*. Although *ner Chanukah* has the special aspect of *pirumei nissa*, nevertheless, since *ner Shabbos* was instituted on account of *shalom bayis*, it takes precedence. If *shalom bayis* is a reason to forfeit the *mitzvah* of *ner Chanukah* altogether, said Rav Nochumke, surely it is a reason to delay it.²⁴

The *poskim* further state that it is better for a person to light at a later time than to have someone (e.g. his wife) light earlier on his behalf, for one should preferably perform *mitzvos* himself and even if he lights later he can still fulfill the *mitzvah*.²⁵

The Proper Location of the Menorah

A primary significance of lighting the *menorah* is to publicize the *nes* that occurred to *Klal Yisroel*. During the time of the *Gemara*, the *menorah* was placed at the entrance of the courtyard to the public thoroughfare or at the doorway of one's house that opened to the public thoroughfare. The *menorah* was placed within a *tefach* (approximately 3.5 inches) of the doorway and on the left side of the doorway, so that one would be surrounded by *mitzvos*: the *mezuzah* on the right side and the *menorah* on the left side. When people walked passed the courtyard, they noticed the *menorah*, and in this way the miracle of *Chanukah* was publicized.²⁶ This is still the general practice in *Eretz Yisroel*.

The *poskim* wonder why this practice is not found outside of *Eretz Yisroel*. One reason offered is that due to governmental decrees, as mentioned above, it became the custom to conceal the *neiros* and light indoors and one fulfilled the aspect of *persumei nissa* with the

members of his household. Although nowadays there is no governmental decree against lighting a *menorah*, the custom has remained to light indoors. Additionally, the *Aruch Hashulchan* mentions that it is due to the weather conditions in other countries that the *menorah* is not lit outside. The rain, snow and powerful winds would extinguish the flames of the *menorah*.²⁷

However, many *poskim* maintain that one should still try to publicize the *nes* to the outside public as much as possible. Therefore, they maintain that one who lights the *menorah* inside the house should place the *menorah* near a window facing the street, so that people passing by will notice the *menorah*, and in so doing, the miracle of *Chanukah* will be publicized. This is the general custom.²⁸ Some, though, have the *minhag* to place the *menorah* at the doorway of their house even if the door does not open to any public street.²⁹

The Height of the Menorah

The flame of the *menorah* should preferably be between three *tefachim* (approximately 10.5 inches) and ten *tefachim* (approximately 35 inches) from the floor of the room.

When lighting by a window, the *poskim* say that preferably one should not place the flame of the *menorah* more than ten *tefachim* above the floor of the room. If there are two window-sills, one being higher than ten *tefachim* and the other lower than ten *tefachim*, one should light the *menorah* on the lower one. If all window-sills are above ten *tefachim*, it is still better to place the *menorah* by a window facing the street rather than placing it on a chair or table inside the house, unless, as mentioned above, one's *minhag* is to light by the door.³⁰

The *menorah* should not be placed higher than twenty *amos* (approximately 35 feet) from the ground outside. Therefore, if a person lives in an upper-story apartment that is more than 20 *amos* above street level, they should light the *menorah* within a *tefach* of the entrance to the apartment. The *menorah* should be placed on the left side of the doorway, as was done during the times of the *Gemara*.³¹

Some *poskim* maintain that if people in other apartment buildings nearby can see the *menorah*, one may light the *menorah* in the window of their apartment even if it is above twenty *amos* from the ground.³²

Moving the Menorah

The *menorah* should not be moved after it has been lit.³³

Lighting in Shul

There is a time-honored custom to light the *menorah* in *shul* during *Chanukah*, although the *mitzvah* was instituted to be performed in one's home. There are several reasons offered by the *poskim* for this *minhag*. Some say that the *minhag* developed in order to fulfill the obligation of the homeless individuals who would sleep in *shul*. Others say that in the times of *Chazal*, due to governmental decrees, one was unable to publicize the miracle to the general public, and therefore, it became the custom to light in *shul* as well. Additionally, it is considered quite significant to sanctify *Hashem's* name and publicize the *nissim* in public. Lighting in the *bais haknesses* also commemorates the lighting of the *menorah* in the *Bais Hamikdosh*.³⁴

Although some of these reasons may not be applicable today, the custom has remained.

Many of the *poskim* struggle to find legitimacy for reciting a *bracha* when lighting the *menorah* in *shul*, for the *mitzvah* was not instituted in such a manner, but was established as a *mitzvah* to be performed at home. The general custom is to recite a *bracha* when lighting the *menorah* in *shul*. The rationale given by the *poskim* is that one may recite a *bracha* when performing an act that is only a *minhag*, just as we recite a *bracha* prior to saying *Hallel* on *Rosh Chodesh* when its recital is only a *minhag*.³⁵

The general custom is to place the *menorah* near the southern wall of the *shul* with the *neiros* lined up from east and west. This symbolizes the placement of the *menorah* in the *Bais Hamikdosh*. Some have the custom for the person lighting the *menorah* to stand behind the *menorah* with his back toward the southern wall and then proceed to light in the same manner as one does at home. Others face the wall and light in the same direction as they would at home.³⁶

The custom is to light the *menorah* in *shul* between *Mincha* and *Maariv*. On *Erev Shabbos*, when waiting for the completion of *Mincha* would be running to close to *Shabbos*, one should light before *Mincha*. There need not be ten people present in *shul* while lighting the *menorah*, although it is preferred.³⁷

Lighting at Public Street Gatherings

We mentioned above that many *poskim* searched for a legitimate basis for lighting the *menorah* in *shul* and the permissibility of reciting a *bracha*. The rationale given by the *poskim* is that it is an ancient *minhag* which could warrant a *bracha*. Many *poskim* have taken strong stances against those who make public street lighting ceremonies and recite a *bracha* when lighting the *menorah*. The same

applies to those who recite a *bracha* when lighting the *menorah* at private *mesibos*. In the words of the *poskim*, "making a *bracha* in *shul* is itself a *chiddush* and one cannot expand it."³⁸

The *poskim* also point out other non-*halachic* issues with making such public street gatherings on *Chanukah*, which is beyond the scope of our discussion.³⁹

Yeshivah Bochorim Who Reside In a Dormitory

Rav Aharon Kotler and others *pasken* that, in all cases, a *yeshivah bochur* should light the *menorah* in the dining room where he eats, rather than lighting in his dormitory room.⁴⁰

However, Rav Moshe Feinstein and many others *pasken* that a *yeshivah bochur* who resides in a dormitory and usually eats his meals in a public dining room should light the *menorah* in the room in which he sleeps, because a bedroom is considered a place that is set aside for one's personal use. (Since this may be a fire hazard, some *yeshivos* have a policy prohibiting *bochorim* from lighting the *menorah* in their dorm rooms. If such a policy exists, the *bochorim* should light in the dining room.)

If several *bochorim* sleep in the same room, each of them should light their *menorah* near a window or door.¹⁹ In accordance with what we mentioned earlier, if the dormitory is above twenty *amos*, the *bochorim* should light their *menorahs* within a *tefach* of the entrance to the room. However, if someone passing by would not be able to discern how many *menorahs* are lit (because they're all placed together in one location), it is preferable for each *bochur* to light his *menorah* near his own bed, rather than placing all the *menorahs* together next to the door.⁴¹

Yeshivah bochorim who go home to eat supper during *Chanukah* and are at home during the time of *hadlaka*, may light at home even though they will be returning to *yeshivah* at night to sleep. Their home is considered their home even if, temporarily, they aren't sleeping there that night. Similarly, if they are in *yeshivah* during the *zeman* of *hadlaka* and plan on going home to sleep, they may light the *menorah* in *yeshivah* even though they won't be sleeping there that particular night. However, if they will be leaving *yeshiva* immediately after lighting the *menorah*, then it is better for them to delay lighting until they come home.

A *yeshivah bochur* who spends an extensive amount of time in the dorm and still constantly returns home, is considered to have two homes and may fulfill the *mitzvah* in ei-

ther location, even if he won't be sleeping in that location that night.⁴²

The Most Preferable Menorah, Casings, Oil and Wicks to Use

Oils and Wicks

All oils and wicks are kosher to use for *ner Chanukah*, whether it is on *Shabbos* or during the week. Although not all oils and wicks are kosher for *ner Shabbos*, the reason for that is because if one uses inferior quality oil or wicks and the flame is not burning properly, we are afraid that one may wish to utilize the light (e.g. to read) and may come to adjust it on *Shabbos*, which is forbidden.

Concerning *ner Chanukah*, one is forbidden to derive any benefit from the *neiros* and therefore no such fear exists. Additionally, the *halacha* is that "*kovsa ain zokuk lah*," if the *ner* gets extinguished, one need not relight it and the *mitzvah* has been fulfilled even if it did not burn for a half-hour. Therefore, one is not required to obtain higher quality wicks and oil to ensure that it will burn for that length of time. Simply placing ample fuel that has the potential to burn for that length of time is sufficient.

Nonetheless, it is preferable to use items such as olive oil and paraffin candles that will produce a pure and clear flame. Olive oil is more preferable than paraffin candles since the *nes* in the *Bais Hamikdosh* occurred with olive oil.⁴³

The *Shulchan Aruch* rules that one may reuse the same wicks every night. The same holds true for the remaining oil of the previous nights.⁴⁴

Paraffin-Coated Floating Wicks

Some raised a question concerning using paraffin-coated floating wicks on *Chanukah*. The primary problem is based on the claim that when the wicks are kindled, the paraffin burns first and only then, once the coating is gone, does the wick draw from the oil. The *halacha* is that "*hadlaka oseh mitzvah*," the act of kindling is what fulfills the *mitzvah*. Additionally, as we pointed out before, "*kovsa ain zokuk lah*," if the *ner* gets extinguished - even right after it is lit - one need not relight it. Consequently, if paraffin-coated floating wicks are used and the flame goes out immediately after it was lit, then technically, even if there was olive oil in the cup, one did not perform the *mitzvah* with the oil, because the paraffin is what burned and not the oil.

The *gedolei haposkim*, however, rule leniently in this regard and maintain that the fact that it takes a few seconds for the paraffin to burn before the wick begins to draw oil is

trivial and that it is all part of the act of lighting. Additionally, it is quite possible that the wick does immediately draw from the oil upon being lit and the paraffin coating doesn't burn but simply melts away as oil is drawn. According to these two reasons, using such a wick may actually be preferable because it produces a beautiful flame. Some suggest that if one wishes to be *machmir*, he can turn over the wicks and dip them into the oil before lighting them. Alternatively, one can first singe the wicks and extinguish them and then relight them *l'sheim mitzvah*.⁴⁵

Large Menorahs

We mentioned above that the flame should not be higher than ten *tefachim* (approximately 35 inches). This should be taken into consideration when purchasing a large *menorah*.

The *poskim* write that *menorahs* in *shuls* may be larger since the main purpose in lighting it is for the entire *shul* to notice it. Also, in instances where one's window-sill is higher than 35 inches, the size of the *menorah* is irrelevant, since even if it was smaller, the *neiros* would be higher than 35 inches.⁴⁶

Oil Menorahs that Have a Back

There is a question concerning *menorahs* that have backs where the *neiros* can only be seen from one direction. Most of the ancient *menorahs* possessed backs. This was because, as mentioned above, in light of governmental decrees, the lighting was performed inside the house near a wall, and the backs served to protect the walls from getting discolored from the burning flame.

The question is, nowadays when the general custom is to light by the window inside one's house - whereby one publicizes the *nes* to the passersby outside in addition to one's household - in which direction do the *neiros* have to be visible and facing - toward the inside of the house or toward the street?

A number of *poskim* feel that if one is lighting during a time when people are still frequenting the streets, the *neiros* should be exposed to the outside. In this situation, the *menorah* should be lit in the regular direction, pretending as if the back were not there.

If one is lighting late at night or in an apartment that is too high or not facing the street, he should light the *menorah* with the *neiros* facing inside the house.⁴⁷

Using Glass Cups to Hold the Oil

The *Chesed L'Avrohom*, grandfather of the *Chida*, writes that he found an ancient manuscript from the son of the *Raavad* who writes that the *neiros Chanukah* have to be placed in a utensil. The manuscript stated that

although there was no source for this, he had heard it from *Eliyahu Hanovi*. Therefore, according to this opinion, one cannot take candles and simply stick them onto a table without having any utensil holding them in place. The *Avnei Neizer* ruled accordingly. Additionally, the *Chesed L'Avrohom* ruled that, in accordance with this view, one may not fill up egg shells with oil to use for *ner Chanukah* since an eggshell is not a utensil.⁴⁸

According to this, if the *ner Chanukah* is placed in any item which cannot stand on its own without being supported by another item, it cannot be used. Some therefore questioned the popular use of glass cups in *menorahs*, since, in general, the glass cups cannot stand on their own and therefore do not qualify as utensils. Additionally, one should lose out on the *hiddur* of having a beautiful *menorah* since the oil is being placed into the glass cups and not directly into the *menorah*.

The *poskim* however, rule leniently. Firstly, they maintain that there is no such requirement to place the oil or candles into a utensil and it is not mentioned in any of the *Rishonim* from where normative *halacha* is derived. Additionally, these glass cups are considerate subordinate to the *menorah* and it is considered as if the *menorah* itself is holding the oil.⁴⁹

Electric Menorahs and Flashlights

The *mitzvah* of lighting the *menorah* should not be performed with an electric *menorah*. There are several reasons offered by the *poskim* as to why this is so.

Firstly, one must use a wick and fuel for *ner Chanukah*, both of which could be considered to be lacking in an electric light. Even if one were to argue and say that the electricity is considered fuel and the filament could be considered a wick, some *poskim* note that in order to fulfill the *hadlaka* one must have enough fuel present for the *ner* to burn for a half-hour. Electricity is constantly drawn and can be shut off at any given moment, so it should not be considered as if there is sufficient 'fuel' present for it to burn for the required amount of time. A battery-operated light (e.g. a flashlight) might be better in this regard, but it still has other problems raised by the *poskim*.

Therefore, unless it is an extenuating circumstance (e.g. one is in a location where he can't light the *menorah*, such as in a hospital, and he has no one to light for him at home), one should not use an electrical device for *ner Chanukah*. In a situation where an electrical device is used, no *bracha* should be recited.⁵⁰

Lighting Outdoors in Glass Casings

We mentioned above that the *halacha* is that even if the *ner Chanukah* gets extinguished, the *mitzvah* has been fulfilled and there is no requirement to relight it. However, if the *menorah* was initially lit in a windy area and it got extinguished prior to burning for a half-hour, one is required to relight it.

The following question was thus raised. In *Eretz Yisroel*, it is quite a common practice for people to light their *menorahs* outdoors. In order to prevent the wind from blowing out the *neiros*, most people insert their *menorahs* into glass casings. The casings have a door on the front or side through which to light the *menorah*. The question was as follows. If the door would not be closed following the *hadlaka*, the *neiros* would definitely get extinguished. If so, since the act of lighting is the integral part of the *mitzvah*, it should be considered as if the *menorah* was lit in a windy area, which is unacceptable.

Indeed, the Brisker Rov was stringent in this regard and used a special casing which was suspended in the air and had an opening on the bottom of it through which he could light the *menorah*. Thus, even if the door was not closed, the *neiros* would not get blown out.

Most *poskim*, however, ruled leniently and maintained that even if one lights in a windy area, he has fulfilled the *mitzvah*. The requirement to relight the *menorah* if it got extinguished was only a penalty instituted by the *Rabbonon*. In this case, the *neiros* did not get extinguished, and therefore, the performance of the *mitzvah* was perfectly acceptable.⁵¹

The Proper Decorum While the Neiros Are Burning

After lighting the *menorah*, one should remain in the room for a short amount of time.

One of the key factors in the downfall of the Greeks was brought about by a woman. (*Yehudis* cut off the head of one of the Greek generals after feeding him wine and cheese to make him drowsy). Therefore, women have a *minhag* to abstain from performing work *at home* for the amount of time the lights of the *menorah* must burn (i.e. a half-hour). Consequently, a woman should refrain from laundering clothing, sewing and doing similar *melachos* while the *neiros* are burning.⁵²

Deriving Benefit from the Chanukah Neiros

One may not derive any benefit from the light of the *Chanukah menorah*. Therefore, there is a *minhag* to place an additional *ner*, called the *shamos*, together with the rest

of the *neiros* of the *menorah*. The *shamos* is used to light the other *neiros* and is placed next to the *menorah* as an additional light, so that if one benefits from the light of the *menorah*, he will be benefiting from the *shamos*. The *shamos* should be placed slightly apart from the rest of the *neiros* so that it should not be confused with the others. The *minhag* is to light a *shamos* even in a room where there is additional light and there is absolutely no need for the light of the *menorah*.⁵³

There is another *minhag* not to kindle one *ner* from another, and therefore, as mentioned, one should use the *shamos* to assist in the lighting of the other *neiros*.⁵⁴ In addition to not deriving any benefit from the light of the *menorah*, it is likewise prohibited to derive any benefit from oil that remained in the *menorah* after a *ner* got extinguished. Since the oil was destined to be used for the fulfillment of the *mitzvah*, no benefit may be derived from it. Therefore, the *mechaber* rules that all the oil that is left over in the *menorah* after *Chanukah* should be burned. To avoid having to burn it, one may stipulate prior to lighting the *menorah* that only the oil that is needed for the fulfillment of the *mitzvah* should become sanctified. One is then permitted to derive benefit from the remaining oil. If one did not make a stipulation on an earlier night, he may still use that oil for the *menorah* on any subsequent night of *Chanukah*.⁵⁵

Erev Shabbos Chanukah

On *Erev Shabbos Chanukah*, one should preferably *daven Mincha* prior to lighting the *menorah*. The *menorah* should be lit as close as possible to the time one normally lights *Shabbos neiros*. The *minhag* is to light the *menorah* prior to lighting the *Shabbos neiros*. The earliest time to light the *menorah* on *Erev Shabbos Chanukah* is *plag hamincha* (an hour and a quarter before sunset).⁵⁶

A woman who is home alone and forgot to light the *menorah* before lighting her *Shabbos neiros* may no longer light the *menorah* herself. Instead, she should call someone who was not yet *mekabel Shabbos*, and ask him or her to light the *neiros*. Although the person lighting the *neiros* should say the *bracha* of "*lehadlik ner*," she may recite the *bracha* of "*she'asa nissim*" (and *shehecheyanu* if it is the first night) herself. If she cannot find another *Yid* who was not *mekabel Shabbos* yet, or if it is already after *shekiah* but within the period of *bain hashmashos* (the first 30 minutes after sunset), a *goy* may be called to light the *menorah*, but no *bracha* is recited.⁵⁷ On *Erev Shabbos Chanukah*, one should place enough oil or use large candles that have the ability to burn for approximately two hours, so that the

neiros will burn for at least one half-hour after nightfall.⁵⁸

One who will be leaving his home for *Shabbos* should light the *menorah* at his host's house. However, if one will not have ample time to light the *menorah* upon arriving at his host's house, he should light at home before leaving on *Erev Shabbos*.⁵⁹

If one will be a guest at two places, one where he will be eating his meals and the other where he will be sleeping, he should light the *menorah* at the location where he will be eating. If the place where one will be eating is a hall, then, according to many *poskim*, it is better to light the *menorah* where one will be sleeping.⁶⁰

If one will be eating the Friday night meal in one place and will be sleeping and eating the rest of his meals at one other location, he should light the *menorah* at the location where he will be sleeping.⁶¹

In all of the above cases, if one will still be home after *plag hamincha* on *Erev Shabbos*, he can light at home. However, since he won't be around to be *nehene* (to benefit) from the *neiros* after it becomes dark, he should preferably light where he will be for *Shabbos*. If one is only eating the Friday night meal elsewhere and will be returning home to sleep, he should definitely light at home. If possible, one should place enough oil in the *menorah* for the *neiros* to burn until the time he comes home. This should especially be done if one is not lighting by a window.⁶²

Motzoei Shabbos Chanukah

On *Motzoei Shabbos Chanukah*, the *menorah* is lit in shul prior to saying *Havdalah*.⁶³ There are different customs regarding the lighting of the *menorah* at home on *Motzoei Shabbos Chanukah*. Some maintain that the *menorah* should be lit prior to reciting *Havdalah*, while others maintain that *Havdalah* should be recited first. Most have the custom to say *Havdalah* first. Each person should follow his own custom.⁶⁴

A person who went away for *Shabbos* and plans to return home on *Motzoei Shabbos* should wait to light the *menorah* until he arrives at home. If one does not plan on being home until very late at night, he can light at the location he stayed at for *Shabbos*. Preferably, after lighting the *menorah* in such a situation, one should remain at his host's home for a while and perhaps even eat *melava malka* there.⁶⁵

Being Away From Home during the Time of Lighting the Menorah

The various *halachos* concerning travelers on *Chanukah* are a bit complicated. We will, however, attempt to present some of the

basic guidelines and discuss common situations. However, since there are a number of variables that must be taken into consideration, a *rov* should be consulted for each particular case.

Coming Home Very Late

A person who will not be home at the proper time to light the *menorah* should conduct himself as follows. If he will be home later that night and his family will still be awake when he arrives at home, he should light the *menorah* when he comes home. However, if he will be returning so late that his family will already be asleep and he won't be able to wake them, he should tell his wife or appoint a messenger to light for him at the proper time. If his wife or the messenger did not light for him and his family is already asleep when he comes home, he should light without reciting a *bracha*.⁶⁶

A person who is leaving his house after *plag hamincha* and will not be returning home until later that night when his family is already sleeping, should light the *menorah* prior to leaving his house (i.e. if he cannot appoint someone else to light the *menorah* for him during the proper time). He should place sufficient oil for the *neiros* to burn until at least one half-hour past nightfall.⁶⁷

Lighting in the Office

A person who eats most of his meals in his office but comes home to sleep should light the *menorah* at home.⁶⁸

A Guest at Someone Else's House

One who leaves his house with his entire family and sleeps over at another person's house for one night, should either light his own *menorah* at the host's house or pay for some of the oil that the host is using to light his own *menorah*. By doing so, the guest becomes a partner in the *mitzvah* and thereby fulfills the requirement through the lighting of the host. Alternatively, the host may designate some of the oil as a gift to his guest.

If there are some family members who remained at home and are lighting the *menorah* with the intent to be *motzie* those family members who are away from home, those who are away automatically fulfill their requirement and are not required to light the *menorah* themselves or acquire some of the host's oil.⁶⁹ However, since according to the *mehadrin min hamehadrin minhag* of the *Ashkenazim* everyone in the house must light their own *menorah*, one should instruct his family members not to have him in mind. If he cannot contact them, he should light the *menorah* himself prior to the time his household lights, or hear the *brachos* from someone

else. Some maintain that it also helps if one has specific intent before the time his family members light not to fulfill his obligation with their lighting. However, not all *poskim* agree with this last approach.⁴²

Eating Supper at a Friend's House During Chanukah

If a person eats supper at a friend's house and plans to return home to sleep, he must light the *menorah* when he gets home. Lighting in his friend's house is tantamount to lighting in the street since it is not considered his place of lodging as he plans to go home to sleep.⁶⁹

A Wedding During Chanukah

One who attends a wedding during *Chanukah* and will be returning home to sleep must light the *menorah* at home and not at the wedding.⁷⁰

Moreover, even one who will not be returning home that night but will be sleeping at someone else's house (e.g. after an out-of-town wedding), according to many *poskim*, should light at their host's house. The same is true for the *chosson* and *kallah*; they should delay lighting until after the *chasuna* and light the *menorah* at the location they will be staying at that night.⁷¹

Flying Overseas

A person who will be flying overseas during *Chanukah* and has to leave his house before *plag hamincha*, should have someone in his house be *motzie* him if he will not be arriving at his destination until the next day. Many *poskim* permit this even if one's home is in a different time zone than the location he is currently in and the day in his location is not the same day as his home location when the *hadlaka* takes place.

If one is unable to have someone in his house be *motzie* him with their *hadlaka*, he should take along a flashlight on the plane and turn it on without reciting a *bracha*. This is a very big *bedieved*, however, and one should make every effort to have someone in his house light for him.⁷²

Taking the Family on a Road Trip

If an entire family will be leaving prior to *plag hamincha* to take a long road trip through the night and there is no one to light for them at home that night, they do not have the ability to fulfill the *mitzvah* since they won't be in any "*bayis*" that night. Lighting in the car or at a rest area does not qualify as an acceptable *hadlaka*. If they pass a Jewish house and see *neiros Chanukah* lit in the window, they should recite the *bracha* of *she'asa nissim* (and *shehecheyonu* if it is the first night).⁷³

1. ועי' שם שבת דף קא, ועי' רמב"ם פ"ג ה"ג, ע"ש, ועי' שרע רומ"א סי' תרע.
2. עי' שרע רומ"א סי' טע"ב ועי' מ"ב שם.
3. עי' בה"ל סי' תרע"ז ח"ל; עיין בתשובת מהרש"ל סימן פ"ה שכתב שראוי שמשמחה תוא מעורבת ובלילה בשמחת תורה ואל הבטל מקביעותו ע"כ. ובערה"ש שאנשים שתחת זמירות ושמחתו שהיה להלל להשי' על הנשים שעשה לנו הוא מרבים בשחוק הקרעין והרבה הערעיש הסודק ע"ז והשומר נפשו ירחק מזה, ע"כ. ועי' חת"ס יוד" סי' רל"ג שהיה הלל והודאה אולי דאורייתא, ועי' משכ"ב בש"ה דברים נפלאים בסוף עניני תפלה שימים אלו נתנו לתמדת התורה ולחזור ללימודו, ועי' משכ"ב במאירי במס' שבת שם.
4. עי' בני יששכר מא"ב אות כ"ז, א"ת כ"ז, ועי' פסקי תשובות סי' תרע"ב שהביא שם אריכות בזה.
5. בענין אם נר חנוכה היה חובת הנבירה או חובת בית או צירוף של שניהם שם אריכות בזה. ואב"מ"ל רק להדגיש כמה ראשי פרטים בזה. עי' תוס' במס' סוכה. מ"ב ב"ה הרואה נר חנוכה ח"ל; שאר מצות גנון לולב וסוכה לא תקינו לברך לרואה אלא גבי נר חנוכה משום חביבותו והס' וגם משום "שיש כמה בני אדם שאין להם בתים" ועי' בירם ליקים המצוה, וטעם ראשון ניהא דלא תיקשי ליה מוזהו, ע"ש. ומשמע מזה שהוא חובת הבית כמו מוזהו, ומי שאין לו בית ליקא חיוב כלל דאי לא תימא חובי מי מקום לחלק בנינים. ופשוט מדברי תוס' שאינו יכול להדליק ברחוב וצריך בית לזה, וכן משמע מרש"י במס' שבת כג. שתיקן ברכת הרואה למי שישב בספינה, שמעשה שבד"ג אינו יכול להדליק ועי' בט"ז סי' תרע"א סק"ב בענין מי שאוכל עורת אקראי בבית חבר שאינו יכול להדליק שם שהיה כשם שהדליק ברחוב, וכן איתא באג"מ י"ג ח"ג סי' י"ה, וכן איתא במנחת שלמה ח"ב סי' נ"ח, וכן איתא במקרא קודש סי' י"ח, ודברי שר"ת צ"א ח"א סי' כ"ט, ואז נדברו ח"ו סי' ס"ג, צ"ע, ועי' משכ"ב בר"ן מס' שבת דף ק' בדפי הרי"ף ד"ה אמר, כשמפרש חידוש של הדין באכסניא חייב כבר חנוכה וז"ל אורח ארעא שישן או לא בית דלא תימא נר נר חנוכה כדון מוזהו דלמי שאין לו בית פטור מן המוזהו, ע"ש. וז"ל שאף שמדליק מדין מוזהו מ"מ מודה שאינו יכול להדליק ברחוב רק צירוף שאינו שיהיה ביתו כמו מוזהו ומיהו גם בית של אכסניא שזה הציון של הגמ' שבא לפרש מ"מ ש' משמעות שאינו ממש חובת הבית או חובת הגוף אלא צירוף משניהם. א. איתא צריך להדליק בשתי בתים אף שהם שלו כמו מוזהו. ב. עי' בסי' תרע"ז שמי שמי שמדליק בשביל אכסניא צריך כוונה להוציא, ע"ש שמדליקין "עליו ועי' בט"ז שם סק"א, ואינו יוצא סתם כמה שהדליק בביתו כמו מוזהו. ג. איתא בפוס' שמעיל כוונה ביתו שלא להוציא ולכן יכול להדליק כמו המודרין, עי' שר"ת ר"ע"א מהדור"ת סי' י"ג, ועי' במ"ב בסי' תרע"ז סק"ו, ט"ז, בענין כוונה אכסניא של אורח ארעא שישן, אשתו. ד. אינו יכול לצאת סתם בית או למנות לשליל להדליק בסתם בית כמו בית השלח, ומשמע שאינו סתם חובת הגוף אלא קשור בביתו. ה. די נר אחד בביתו אף שיש חיוב על כל אחד ואחד, ולבד כוונה שהדלקה זו תהיה לכל בני ביתו, וז"ל בה"ל בסי' תרע"ה ד"ה אבשי שאין אחרים וכו'. וז"ל אלא לארס אשתו וכן מברכין לו כשאינו בביתו מפני שעיקר חיוב מונח על הבית, ע"ש. ואם היה סתם חובת הגוף היה אומרים לו, ולכן צ"ל שהוא הצירוף של שניהם, ואין לומר שיש חובת הגוף להיות אחראי שיהיה הדלקה בביתו, משמע מפוס' אם לא כוון להוציא אף שהדליק בביתו אינו יוצא, ואם יש חובת הגוף שיהיה אחראי, ע"ש מ"מ היה הדלקה, אלא י"ל שיש חובת הד"ר הדיינו מי שדר בבית יש חיוב עליו להשתתף ויהיה לו שיתוכן להדליק, ואם כולם בני בית אחד יש חיוב רק להדליק נר אחד בשביל נר איש וביתו, וכיון שכולם סמוך על שלחן אחד מיהא יש חלק לכל אחד בשני ויוצאים בזה, מלבד אם אין שלל יהיה בני ביתו בכלל זה, ובה"ש י"ל כל אחד להדליק ולברך מדין מודרין, ואם הוא אכסניא שאינו סמוך על השולחן שם, השינה שם ומעיל שיהיה עכ"פ פפל לבני ביתו ואינו צריך נר אחד, מ"מ אין לו חלק בהשקט כאשר בני הבית, וצריך לקנות חלק מן השמן, ואם יש חובת הד"ר בבית אחד, מסתפק להחליט אם נחשב בית אחד אף שאינו סמוך על השולחן אחד וז"ל להשתתף בפרטתו כמו אכסניא, או שצריך כל אחד להדליק בפני עצמו,

ואין כאן דין נר וביתו נחשב כשתי בתים. מ"מ צ"ע משום הנהגת המרחב פרענקיל בסי' תרע"א דאם אורח מדליק נירות בבהכ"ז שאפשר שא"צ להדליק באכסניא דגופיה נפטר כמה שהדליק בעצמו בבהכ"ז ובביתו מוליקים עליו ע"ש, וציוני השעה"א את דבריו שם בס"ק נ"ב, וצ"ע טובא, חזא אם בביתו מדליקין עליו שוב אין חיוב כלל להדליק באכסניא, וזו משמע שיש חובת הגוף שאינו תלוי בביתו ויכול לצאת בבהכ"ז, וא"כ למה לא יכול להדליק ברחוב להוציא חובת גופו, ותו צ"ע בבי"ש שם שהביא דברי הכל בו שטעם הדלקה בבהכ"ז להוציא האינם בקיאים, ולכא"א אין אפשר לצאת שם, ומשאר ראשונים שהביא שם לא צאת שם, כן, ועדיין צריך ביאור, ועי' בפ"י במשפ"א אמת בשבת כא. שחקר בזה, ועי' ושרת חכם צבי, ועי' שר"ת מנח"י ח"ו סי' מו, ושרת אנ"מ א"ח ח"א סי' קצ, ואב"מ.
6. עי' מס' שבת שם, ושרע בסי' תרע"א סי' ב'.
7. עי' שרע רומ"א שם, ועי' ט"ז שם שהקשה למה מנהג של הספרדים הוא כמו תוס' ומנהג האשכנזים הוא כהרמב"ם, ועי' בילקוט יוסף שהביא ביאור בזה.
8. עי' רמ"א שם, ועי' בה"ל שבאופן זה גם תוס' מודו בזה.
9. ועי' מ"ב סי' תרע"א סק"ט שהביא דעתו היא כנופן, ובסי' תרע"ה סק"ט שהביא בשם תרע"ז עולת שמואל רד"הוין טפלות לאנשים, ע"ש.
10. כן איתא בהדיא בתוס' עולת שמואל שמצין המ"ב בסי' תרע"ה ס' דק"ן, עי' חידושי החת"ס במ"ב שבת כא. דק"ן, שעיקר הדלקת נר הוא על פתח ביתו מבחוץ ולא היה ראוי להנהיג שהנשים יצאו בלילה בחוץ בין אנשים איבא חסרון של כל כבודה בת מלך פניהם, ולכן אף שעתה מדליקין בפנים, מ"מ נשאר המנהג. עי' מ"ב שבת שם, ועי' שרע"י סי' תרע"ב מ"ב ובה"ל שהאר"ך בהשיות, ועי' במעשה רב שהאנון סבר כמו הרמב"ם שאחר חצי שעה אינו יוצא.
11. עי' אנ"מ א"ח ח"ד סי' קא, וע"ש שהיה טעמים נכונים ע"ז, ולכא"א הוא להדליק אחר בחש"מ שלשיתו בשבית הגר"א הוא ט' דקות אחר השקיעה, וגם ליוצא אל הפתח.
12. עי' במועדים זמנים ח"ו סי' פד, ואז נדברו ח"ו סי' ע' שהאר"ך בזה, ועי' תשו' והנהגת ח"ב סי' של"ד שבוה יוצא כל השניות.
13. עי' מ"ב ובה"ל שם, ואולי אף שר"ת יורה שיקול להדליק קודם ע"כ מינות שצ"ל להדליק בזמן שיש אנשים ברחוב.
14. עי' בה"ל שם.
15. כן הוא הסכמת רוב פוסקים, שדין קרימת תדיר שייך רק אם עומד ליקים עשוי שניהם אבל כשמתפלל מערבי בשעה מאוחרת אין כאן חיוב להקדים התדיר, וכן איתא בש"ת שנת הלוי ח"ו סי' נ"ג, וכן בספר ספירת העומר פ"ג ה"ט שם הגר"ח קניבסקי שליט"א, וז"ל הן בדין הגר"ח איתא מפורש בישועת יעקב סי' תרע"ט, ובאשגת אריה סי' כ"ב, וכן מדויק לשון המ"ב ובה"ל בסי' תרע"ב לענין נר חנוכה ותפלת ערבית שרק היבא שתמיד מתפלל בזמן הדיוט צאת הכוכבים צריך להקדים התדיר, וקצת צ"ע ממשכ"ב באג"מ א"ח ח"ד סי' ט"א.
16. עי' מס' שבת כא. ועי' שרע"י שם.
17. עי' תוס' שם, אכן עי' ברש"י שם שחולק וסובר שאף לפי תירוצו ראשון יכול להדליק רק שאינו מקיים המצוה כתקונה, ועי' ברש"י"א החישוב שפסק בתוס' רק כתב שלפי תירוצו ראשון יכול להביא המנוחה בפנים להדליק ויוצא כמו בשעת הסכנה דאיכא היכרא לבני ביתו.
18. עי' שם, עי' במנחת אריאל שהאר"ך אם היה תקנה מיוחדת לשעת הסכנה, ונפק"מ בזמן הזה שליכא סכנה אם יוצא בפנים, ועי' מקראי קודש סי' טו וע"ש בהערות, ועי' ספר מלעיל ערבית (פסקי הגר"ש איוערבך זצ"ל על מועדים) שהאר"ך מאד בזה, ועי' קוני' חנוכה ומגילת ה"ר טורח"ן זצ"ל סי' ד, ולכא"א משמע מדברי הרמב"א שהביא בציון לעיל שלא היה, ועי' אנ"מ א"ח ח"ד סי' קהו. שלא היה זהו השיתוף שפירסומי ניסא אינו מעכב בהמצוה.
19. עי' ברמ"א שם, ועי' בה"ל שם בהסתר אופן להדליק בזמניו מקודם שמדליקין באופן שנראה לחוץ, ויש פוסקים שפירשו מטעם ענין של זריזין, וכן מבואר במה ראשונים כ"ס שבת שם, ושמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א שצריך להדר להדליק קודם שתכלה רגל מן השוק שבזמן הזה אינו סכנה ולכן מדליקין בחלון הפתוח ב"ה ואינן מניחים ששלטנו כמו שעת הסכנה.
20. כן שמעתיה ממכא פוסקי זמניו ועי' דברי הרמ"א ומ"ב, ש"מ"מ איכא היכרא לבני בית אף שאינו שעת הסכנה, ועי' דברי הרמב"א שהביא לעיל.

22. ועי' חידושי מהרצ"א (מבעל בני יששכר) דף ב' טור א' שמדליק מלשון הרמב"ם שכתב שהוא כמו חצי שעה "או יותר", ועי' מועדים זמנים ח"ב סי' קמ"א, ח"ו סי' פ', ועי' תשו' והנהגת ח"א ז"י ש"ז, ועי' לחע"י שלכא"א אף אם תימא שזמנו בשעה מאוחר מ"מ א"צ לתון יותר שמן מחצי שעה, ודמנפ"פ לפי תירוצו הראשון אין כאן שיעור שמן, ולפי תירוצו שני אין כאן זמן, ודוק.
23. כן שמעתיה מפוסקי זמניו.
24. מעשה זו מפורסם.
25. עי' שר"ת שבת הלוי ח"ד סי' ס, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, דלא כמש"כ בחובת הד"ר פ"א ה"ט, וקא"ו דבריו נאמרו רק בא"י שהמנהג להדליק בחוץ.
26. עי' מס' שבת שם, ובסי' תרע"א סי' ה"ז.
27. עי' אור זרוע הל' חנוכה ת"ט ש"ג שהקשה אי בטלה סכנה למה לא נהגו להדליק בחוץ, ועי' שר"ת מנח"י שהביא דברי העיטור שאחר שנהגו כן נשאר המנהג אף שבטלה הטעם, ועי' ערוה"ש שם סי' ב', ועי' מקראי קודש סי' טו, ועי' מה שציינו לעיל בס"ק י"ו.
28. עי' מ"ב ס"ק לח, וכן שמעתיה מפוסקי זמניו.
29. כן נוהגים, ע"פ משכ"ב בשם האר"ז.
30. עי' שרע"י תרע"א סי' י' ומ"ב סק"ו.
31. עי' שרע"י ומ"ב שם.
32. כן שמעתיה בשם הגר"מ פיינשטיין זצ"ל, ועי' שר"ת שבת הלוי ח"ד סי' סה, אכן עי' נר איש וביתו פ"ה העי' יא בשם הגר"ש אלישב שליט"א, ועי' תשו' והנהג' ח"ב סי' ש"ג.
33. עי' סי' תרע"ה ס' א' ומ"ב שם.
34. עי' ב"ד בסי' תרע"א שהאר"ך בהטעמים שם ועי' מ"ב שם.
35. עי' ב"ד שם מה שהביא מדברי הריב"ש, ועי' מ"ב שם, ועי' שבלי הל"ק סי' קפ"ה שאין לברך, ועי' שר"ת מהר"ם ש"ס יוד" סי' ש"ע"ד שהחת"ס נמנע מלברך, מ"מ מנהגו לברך, ועי' ילקוט יוסף שמייב"ש למה ספרדים נוהגים לברך אף שאין מברכין על הלל ב"ה.
36. עי' שרע"י ס' ע"ז, ועי' משכ"ב המ"ב סקמ"ג בשם החת"ס, מ"מ הרבה אינו נוהגים כן וכן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שמנהג בבישבות אינו כן.
37. עי' מ"ב ובה"ל שם.
38. עי' שר"ת שבת הלוי ח"ד סי' סה, שר"ת מנח"י ח"ד סי' סה, שר"ת דברי יצ"ב א"ח ח"ב סי' רפ"ז, שר"ת קנין תורה ח"א סי' קל"א, תשו' והנהג' ח"א סי' שצ"ח, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, דלא כמשכ"ב באז נדברו ח"ה סי' לו ובח"א סי' לב.
39. כן שמעתיה מפוסקי זמניו ואב"מ.
40. עי' שר"ת דברי חכמים פרק מג' בשם הגר"ש איוערבך זצ"ל ויב"ח"ט הגר"ש אלישב שליט"א שצריך להדליק בחדר האוכל, וכן שמעתיה במ"ב הגר"א קוטלר זצ"ל, ועי' הל' ג' בחג דף לה משכ"ב בשם החו"א.
41. עי' שר"ת אנ"מ א"ח ח"ד סי' ע"ג, ועי' שר"ת מנח"י ח"ו סי' מח, ועי' מועדים זמנים ח"ו סי' פח שכן הור"י גאון ירושלים.
42. כן שמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"ש מילער שליט"א, ועי' סי' תרע"ז שבאכסניא מהני מה שאשתו מדלקת עליו בביתו אף שאינו ישן שם, מ"מ נחשב ביתו, ועי' בה"ל שם בענין מי שהולך כשולחן אביו לבית אביו או חמוי שכין שסועט וישן שם שאינו מדליק אלא בבית שאוכל וישן שם כבילה דכיון שאין שום אדם בבית למי ידליק, ועי' משמע שיוצא עם מדליק בביתו, שהמ"ב לא כתב שאינו נחשב ביתו אלא למי ידליק שם, ולכן העיקר הוא במקום שישן, מ"מ י"ל שאם הוא התם בזמן הדלקה וזו לו יותר להדליק שם שיוצא ואולי בזמנו עדיף שם, וכ"ש שאם הוא בביתו ממש שהוא עיקר דירתו. ועי' משכ"ב באמת ליעקב סי' תרע"ז בהע"י 590.
43. עי' מס' שבת שם, וכן עי' תרע"א ומ"ב שם.
44. עי' שרע"י ס' ע"ד, ואין עי' לקט יוסף ע"מ קנ"ב שהתרה"ד שהחליף בכל לילה, ועי' דרכי משה בשם הכל בו ובאדוה"רם שיש נוהגים להחליפם, במשכ"ב. ואיני ישרת שם שההידור שדומה לניירות בבהמ"ק.
45. עי' שר"ת להורות נ"ח ח"ו סי' מה שהאר"ך בזה, ועי' קוני' ימי חנוכה בסופו שהביא מהגר"ש ז"ל, ועי' וצ"ל הדשעה אינה דולקת ונמיתה מיד, ושמעתיה מפוס' זמניו שאין חשש בזה, והגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א אמר שאם רוצה להחמיר מעילי העצות שכתבו בפנים, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א ש"א"ש שום עצת ומותר לכתחלה.
46. כן שמעתיה מפוסקי זמניו, ועי' מ"ב סי' תרע"א

ס"ק"ו.
47. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א.
48. עי' שרע"י בסי' תרע"ז סק"ג בשם החסד לאברהם, והכת"י מודפס בספר זכרון להגר"י הוטנר זצ"ל, ועי' שר"ת אבני נור סי' ת"ק.
49. עי' שר"ת שבה"ל ח"ה סי' קפ"ז, שר"ת אז נדברו ח"ו סי' טו, ושמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א שאין חשש בכל, והביא ראי' מסוף פ"ב במס' כלים שבעטל למנוחה.
50. בענין הדלקת חשמל, עי' שר"ת יצחק ח"ב סי' י"א, שר"ת מהר"ש"ג ח"ב סי' ק"ב, שר"ת הר"ר ח"ב סי' ק"ד, ומקראי קודש סי' כ', שר"ת יהוה דעת, ועוד פוסקים, ושמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א שיכול לפקפק בהטענות, ולכן אף שלכתחלה שאין להדליק בזה, מ"מ מצב דוחק יש להדליק בלא ברכה, אלא מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א שמעתיה שאין כאן שום צד שיוצא.
51. שר"ת הר"ר ח"ב סי' ק"ד, שר"ת אז נדברו ח"ו סי' י"ב, תשובות והנהגות ח"ב סי' ש"מ.
52. עי' שרע"י תרע"ז ומ"ב שם ועי' פסקי תשובות שהאר"ך בזה.
53. עי' סי' תרע"ז ומ"ב שם.
54. עי' שרע"י תרע"ז ומ"ב שם.
55. עי' שרע"י תרע"ז סי' ה', ועי' נ"ב שם ומ"ב שם איך שישב הסתירה למשכ"ב בסי' תרע"ב ועע"ש במ"ב ס"ק.
56. עי' שרע"י תרע"ח ותרע"ט, ועי' מ"ב שם.
57. עי' סי' תרע"ט.
58. עי' שרע"י מ"ב ס"ב.
59. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, ועי' שר"ת שבת הלוי ח"ה סי' קנ"ח.
60. עי' סי' תרע"ז סי' א' ומ"ב שם, ועי' ט"ז שהביא פלוגתא בין המהר"ש והרשב"א, וז"ל שכל הפלוגתא כשני מצבים ובשניהם אלו אכסניא או שניהם ביתו, מ"מ כשאר עיקר מודה, דלא כמשכ"ב בחובת הד"ר בפרוש הדברים, ובענין פסק הכתוב בפנים, כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א.
61. עי' ציון לעיל, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א.
62. עי' מ"ב שם ובה"ל מה שהביא מה"ס"ו אם אוכל סעודה באקראי בבית חבירו, וז"ל שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א.
63. עי' מ"ב ומ"ב סי' תרפ"א סי' ב' ומ"ב שם.
64. שם.
65. עי' חובת הד"ר פ"ב הערה ס"ה מפני שאינו נחשב עוד אכסניא, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א שלכתחלה יש להדליק בביתו אם אינו נשער שם זמן רב, אכן עי' שר"ת תשובות והנהגות ח"א סי' שצ"א, ועי' פסקי תשובות משכ"ב בהערה 35 בשם הגר"ש איוערבך זצ"ל, וכן איתא באמת ליעקב בסי' תרע"ז.
66. עי' שר"ת שבת הלוי ח"ד סי' סו, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, ועי' מ"ב סי' תרע"ב סק"א ושע"ז שם שאין לברך אחר שבני בית אינן נעורים. אכן עי' אנ"מ א"ח ח"ד סי' קד"ז לענין ברכה, וספק ברכות להל'.
67. עי' חובת הד"ר, וכן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א.
68. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א שאין זה נחשב ביתו וביתו ישן וגם אוכל שם.
69. עי' מ"ב ובה"ל בסי' תרע"ז בענין מי שסועד אצל חבירו באקראי ויש לו שם בית באותו העיר, ועי' בט"ז שהוא מקור הדבריו וכתב שם שהוא כמו מי שמדליק ברחוב שאינו נחשב ביתו.
70. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, והוא ממש ציור ה"ס שכתבו שאם הולך לישון בביתו אוני קונה בית זה להיות ביתו והיו כמי שמדליק ברחוב אף שאוכל שם, ועי' אמת ליעקב סי' תרע"ז שהוא דבר צחוק להדליק שם.
71. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, אף שיש לומר שדינו כמי שהוא אכסניא בשתי מקומות אחי לאבילה ואחר לשנת השולך בתר מקום אבילה, אין המקום כאן מיוחד לו, ואינו נחשב ביתו, ועי' נישאין כהלכתה וספר נר איש וביתו שהביא כן בשם הגר"ש אלישב שליט"א.
72. כן שמעתיה מפוס' זמניו, ועי' בש"ת תשו' והנהגות שולך בתר ביתו.
73. כן שמעתיה מהגר"ד פיינשטיין שליט"א, ומהגר"י בעלסקי שליט"א, ועי' שרע"י תרע"ז סי' ג' בענין לראות נר חנוכה, ועי' משכ"ב לעיל בציון 5

Please note: "Ask the Gedolei Haposkim" will be in next issue.



Halacha Berurah (USPS #022-439) (ISSN #1553-1821) is published monthly by Cong. Halacha Berurah, 1341 East 23rd Street, Brooklyn, NY 11210-5112. Individual Annual Subscriptions are \$18. Annual Shul Package Subscriptions are \$36. Periodical Postage Paid at Brooklyn, NY and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster please send address change to Halacha Berurah, 1341 East 23rd Street, Brooklyn, NY 11210-5112.

Ephraim Elli Bohm
Publisher; Author

Yitzchok Hisiger
Managing Editor

Mordechai Goldburd
Typeset & Design

Rabbi Meier Saslow
Administrative Assistant

Avrohom Goldberg
Technical Manager

Tzvi Geller
Zeirei Liaison

This Project is
Dedicated לז"נ

ר' פנחס בן ר' זאב
חיה שרה בת ר' יצחק הלוי

Printed by
Franklin Printing
(718) 258-8588

**Sponsorship
Opportunities
Available**

To have your dedication appear on over 8000 printed issues on a desired week, please call (718) 851-5259.

ללמוד לדעת לקיים

מהדורת משפחת אייזענבערג ספר

עשרת הדברות השלם

הספר המקיף בכל הרמות,
כרך ראשון מתוך המפעל האדיר

דיני המצוה, מקורות וביאורים, עיונים, שיח הלכה, ברכת המצוה,
טעמי המצוה, מאוצרות חז"ל - חשיבות המצוה ושכרה, מנין המצוה

למגיד שיעורים - כהרחבה להכנת שיעור
לבני תורה - כהכנה וסכום הסוגיה
ללומדי שיעורים - להעשרת הידע
למחנכים ומורות - חומר עזר לבניית שיעורים
לאבא - כרטיסיות מצורפות ללימוד הילדים
לבני המשפחה - חומר עשיר לשולחן השבת

מפעל רמ"ג מצוות העולמי

מפעל תורה סיבות רבות ליהדות
- מרדכי ומירל אייזענבערג
שנדיבותם חיונים אספור
את הוצאת לאור של כרך זה

Available at Judaica bookstores
or from the distributor: **ISRAEL BOOK SHOP**

888.536.7427 ■ 732.901.3009
FAX 732.901.4012

To subscribe to Halacha Berurah (only \$18/year for a personal subscription,
\$36/year for a shul subscription), please call (718) 851 - 5259

לזכר נשמת
צפורה בת כתר יצחק
Dedicated by **Dr. Charles Tomaszewski and Family**
Phoenix, AZ

לע"נ
יצחק בן אצל
פלורנס צפורה בת חנה
יעקב בן מזל
Dedicated by **Freddie Irani & Family**

אפרים יהושע חיים
בן אמומה לרפ"ש
לע"נ
פלורנס צפורה בת חנה
Dedicated by **Edmund Irani & Family**

לז"נ
ר' משה בן
ר' יוסף אריה
Dedicated by **Berry Reichman and Family**
Toronto, Canada