

Halachically Speaking

Volume 2 Issue 15

Compiled by Moishe Dovid Lebovits
Reviewed by Rav Ben-zion Schiffenbauer Shlita
Piskei Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita
Reviewed by Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita

Chazaras Hashatz

Sponsored

לרפואה שלמה חנה חיה בת מזל

Originally, *chazaras hashatz* was instituted because the congregants did not know the proper way in which to *daven* and the *shliach tzibbur* would be *yotzei* the *kehilla* with his own *shemonei esrei*.¹ Today this is not the case, however *chazaras hashatz* is said.² The *seforim* write regarding the importance of *chazaras hashatz*, even today. The *Kaf Ha'chaim*³ says that *chazaras hashatz* is more important than the quiet *shemonei esrei*. Some say the reason why *chazaras hashatz* was instituted is so that *kedusha* may be recited with ten people.⁴

Standing vs. Sitting

When the *chazzan* is repeating the *Shemonei Esrei* the entire *tzibbur* should stand.⁵ Some *poskim* say the reason is because of *shomea k'oneh*.⁶ (Meaning those who are listening are considered as if they themselves are saying the *chazaras hashatz*). There are certain *poskim* who maintain that one may sit at *chazaras hashatz*,⁷ however, most *poskim* are of the opinion that one should stand. A *ben torah* should make an effort to stand during *chazaras hashatz*.⁸ People who are frail and weak, and cannot stand during *chazaras hashatz*, may sit.⁹ Those who have the custom to sit at *chazaras hashatz* should do so only after the *beracha* of *hukel hakodesh* is completed by the *Shatz*.¹⁰ When the *chazzan* is reciting long *peutim*, then one may sit, as is common on the *Yomim Norayim*.¹¹

¹ Refer to *Gemarah Megillah* 33b, 34b, *Rambam Hilchos Tefilla* 8:4, *Tur* 124, *Bais Yosef, Bach*.

² *Bais Yosef, Bach, Shulchan Aruch* 124:4, *Levush* 9, *Mishnah Berurah* 12, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 8, *Halichos Shlomo Tefilla* 9:3, *Avnei Yushfei* 1:19. It is possible that even today there are people who are not *buki* in *tefilla* (*Tefilla V'hilchoseha* 22:1).

³ 124:2, see *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:2, *Reishis Chuchma Shar Kedusha* 2:page 242 (new).

⁴ *Tur* 124, *Levush* 124:1.

⁵ *Rambam Hilchos Tefilla* 9:3, *Pirkei D'R' Eliezer* 46:56, *Yosef Ometz* 31:page 9, *Darchei Moshe* 124:1, *Rama* 4, *Pri Megadim M.Z.* 2, *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 7, *Siddur Yaavetz* page 281, *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 15:53, *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 20:1, *Mishnah Berurah* 20, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 4, *Yaskil Avdi* 2:2, *Asei Lecha Rav* 7:7, *Oz Nedberu* 2:79:2, 12:59, *Yechaveh Da'as* 5:11, *B' Mechtzas Rabbeinu* says that *Horav Yaakov Kamenetsky zt"l* always stood even when he was older. Refer to *Emes L'Yaakov* page 69.

⁶ *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 7, *Mishnah Berurah* 20, *Rivevos Ephraim* 4:113:147.

⁷ *Halachas Ketanas* 2:80, *Yaskil Avdi* 2:2, *Minhag Yisroel Torah* 124:1, *Bais Avi* 2:44, 3:115:6, *Horav Shlomo Zalman Aurbach zt"l* maintains that it is only a *chumra* to stand (*Halichos Shlomo Tefilla* 9:footnote 35).

⁸ *Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita*, see *Tefilla K'hilchoso* 13:33:footnote 78 quoting the opinion of *Horav Elyashiv Shlita*.

⁹ *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 20:1, *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:10, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 4, *Yalkut Yosef* page 282:6.

¹⁰ *Ketzos Ha'shulchan* 22:21, *Yechaveh Da'as* 5:11, *Yalkut Yosef* page 282:6, *Halichos Olom* 1:page 192:9, *Tefilla K'hilchoso* *ibid*. *Shevet Ha'Levi* 3:15:6.

¹¹ *Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita*, see *Ishei Yisroel* 24:footnote 68, *Mekadesh Yisroel Yamim Norayim* 130.

Listening To Chazaras Hashatz

When the *Shatz* is repeating the *Shemonei Esrei*, the *tzibbur* should be quiet and concentrate on what the *Shatz* is saying, and answer to the *berchos*, *boruch hu u'boruch shemo* and *amen*.¹² If possible, one should look into his *siddur* during *chazaras hashatz* and follow along with the *shliach tzibbur*,¹³ and not look all around during *chazaras hashatz*.¹⁴ Some *poskim* maintain that there should not be any *tzedaka* collecting during *chazaras hashatz*, as this might deter one's concentration.¹⁵ Many *poskim* say that those who have the custom to place *Rabbeinu Tam's tefillin* on as well as *Rashi's tefillin* should not do so during *chazaras hashatz*.¹⁶

Learning

Many people think that learning is permitted during *chazaras hashatz*, however, it is forbidden for one to learn during *chazaras hashatz*.¹⁷ *Horav Chaim Kanievesky Shlita*¹⁸ says, those who learn during *chazaras hashatz*, not only do they not get a reward for their learning, but they get an *aveirah*. One may not say *tachnunim*,¹⁹ or *tehillim*²⁰ during *chazaras hashatz* even if one is able to answer to the end of the *beracha* properly.²¹ One may not look in a *sefer* or think in learning either.²² Others are lenient with this,²³ but one should not rely on this opinion. If one already *davened* and walks into a *shul* while they are in middle of *chazaras hashatz* it is permitted for him to learn.²⁴

Talking During Chazaras Hashatz

One is absolutely forbidden to talk during *chazaras hashatz*.²⁵ Many people are not careful with this *halacha* and they should be notified.²⁶ The *Pri Megadim*²⁷ holds that one is permitted to embarrass another person in order that he should be quiet during *chazaras hashatz*. The sin for talking during *chazaras hashatz* is so great

¹² Refer to *Shulchan Aruch* 124:4, *Levush* 1, *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 6, *Moreh B'etzvah* 31:82, *Siddur Yaavetz* page 281:2, *Yesod V'shoresh Hu'avodah shar chamishi* 6:page 254, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9, *Oz Nedberu* 7:72:6. If there are not ten people answering to can hinge on a *beracha l'vatala* for the *shatz* (*Shulchan Aruch Harav* ibid).

¹³ *Elya Rabbah* 124:12, *Sharei Teshuva* 124:7, *Massei Rav* 43: page 71, *Mishnah Berurah* 124:26, *Be'er Moshe* 8:42:6, *Metzuvei V'osa* page 483.

¹⁴ Refer to *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 15:46, *Mishnah Berurah* ibid, *Oz Nedberu* 2:79:2.

¹⁵ *Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham* 132, *M.Z.* 566:3, *Mishnah Berurah* 92:36, *Be'er Moshe* 8:42:6, see *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 11:19, *Me'am Loez Vayigash* page 785, *Teshuvos V'hanhugos* 1:61, 3:287

¹⁶ *Pri Megadim M.Z.* 34:2, *Zichron Yehuda* 1:5, *Yabea Omer* 3:4, see *Pri Hasadeh* 2:97, *Maharsham* 8:12, *Lekutei Maharich* 1:page 42.

¹⁷ *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 6, *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:10, *Mishnah Berurah* 17, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 17, *Oz Nedberu* 4:14:4 page 34., *Bais Hayeudi* 1:82:2. One who does learn should be rebuked for doing so (*Shulchan Aruch* ibid, *Shulchan Aruch Harav* ibid).

¹⁸ *Orchos Yosher* page 104:28.

¹⁹ *Siddur Yaavetz* ibid, *Mishnah Berurah* 17, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9, *Yaskil Avdi* 5:20. People will learn from you and you will make others sin (*Shulchan Aruch Harav* 6).

²⁰ *Siddur Yaavetz* ibid, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9.

²¹ *Mishnah Berurah* 17, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 9.

²² *Kaf Ha'chaim* 16, *Igros Moshe O.C.* 4:19, *Halichos Shlomo Tefilla* 9:footnote 11, *Teshuvos V'hanhugos* 1:106, *Rivevos Ephraim* 4:44:116, 5:61, *Tzitz Eliezer* 11:10, *Oz Nedberu* 14:14:4 page 34, *Halichos Olom* 1:page 192. This is even if the *shatz* is quiet for a moment (*Igros Moshe O.C.* 5:20:9).

²³ *Magen Avraham* 8, *Be'er Hetiv* 7, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 16.

²⁴ Refer to *Mishnah Berurah* 90:58, *Ishei Yisroel* 24:15.

²⁵ *Shulchan Aruch* 124:7, *Reishis Chuchma shar kedusha* page 241 (new), *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:10, *Mishnah Berruah* 131:1, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 12, *Yaskil Avdi* 5:20, *Metzuvei V'osei* pages 470-471. Many say that one should be appointed to make sure people do not talk. (*Mishnah Berurah* 27, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 37, A *Rav* who is asked a question may answer the question (*Aruch Ha'shulchan* ibid). A *chillul Hashem* is created if one talks during *davening*. (*Aruch Ha'shulchan* ibid). Refer to *Orchos Chaim L'Rosh* page 8:14 who permits learning etc.

²⁶ *Shulchan Aruch* ibid, *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 10, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 12.

²⁷ *Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham* 11, see *Elya Rabbah* 12, *Mishnah Berurah* 27.

that the *Shulchan Aruch* writes,²⁸ ”**the sin is too great to carry.**” It is interesting to note that this is the only time the *Shulchan Aruch* uses this *loshon*. The *Shulchan Aruch Harav*²⁹ explains that if one talks while the *shatz* is mentioning the praises of *Hashem*, it demonstrates that he has no desire to join the *chazzan* in praising *Hashem*. Others say the *chazaras hashatz* acts as a lawyer on our behalf and imagine talking while he is trying to argue your case. If one *davened* already, he should still not talk while *chazaras hashatz* is being repeated.³⁰

Talking Before Chazaras Hashatz

When one finishes his quiet *Shemonei Esrei*, and he is waiting for the *shliach tzibbur* to start *chazaras hashatz*, he may not talk.³¹ The same is true for the *shatz* before he starts the *chazaras hashatz*.³² Learning is not permitted, but glancing into a *sefer* is permitted for both the *Shatz*, and the one waiting for the *Shatz*, in the aforementioned situation.³³ Some say that one may catch up on certain parts of *davening* that he might have missed,³⁴ or he may even recite *tehillim*.³⁵ Answering *devarim sh'bekedusha* is permitted as well.³⁶

Remaining In Ones Place

After one has finished his quiet *Shemonei Esrei*, and has taken three steps back, one should stay in his place until the *Shatz* starts *kedusha* or at least until the *chazaras hashatz* has started.³⁷ Many people walk back to their seat, right after they finish *Shemonei Esrei*, and this is not the proper thing to do.³⁸ Some say that one should stand the same way he stands when saying *Shemonei Esrei*.³⁹ The *Aruch Ha'shulchan*⁴⁰ says there is no need to do this, and this is the *minhag*. After *maariv* one should wait in his place for as long as it would take him to walk four *amos*,⁴¹ while others are careful to wait until the *chazzon* starts *kaddish*.⁴²

Singing Along With The Shatz

One should be careful not to sing along the words with the *chazzan* during *chazaras hashatz*.⁴³

²⁸ Ibid, see *Kaf Ha'chaim* 38 this is besides for the sin of talking in a *shul*. Refer to *Metzuvei V'osei* pages 470-471 why the sin of talking during *chazaras hashatz* is so severe.

²⁹ 124:10.

³⁰ *Salmas Chaim* 95 (old print), *Kinyan Torah* 2:36:3:page 81, refer to *Ishei Yisroel* 24:footnote 61 quoting the opinion if *Horav Chaim Kanievesky Shlita*. Some say one can talk after *kedusha* (*Kaf Ha'chaim* 125:16).

³¹ *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 15:52, *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:10.

³² *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 15:52, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 124:1, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 111:4, see *Be'er Moshe* 3:17.

³³ Refer to *Ben Ish Chai Teruma* 1:10, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 124:1, *Ishei Yisroel* 24:footnote 145, *Yabea Omer* 9:page 159:2. Others are lenient with learning as well (*Ishei Yisroel* 23:70:footnote 225 new).

³⁴ *Halichos Olom* 1:page 191.

³⁵ *Ishei Yisroel* ibid. Refer to *Mevakshei Torah* 3:page 250:54.

³⁶ *Mishnah Berurah* 111:10, *Ishei Yisroel* 24:footnote 9 (old).

³⁷ Refer to *Shulchan Aruch* 123:2, *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 123:3, *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 18:13, *Mishnah Berurah* 10, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 123:4, *Be'er Moshe* 3:15, *Halichos Shlomo Tefilla* page 115:footnote 43, *V'ei Lumo Michshal* 1:page 143, *Asei Lechu Rav* 7:8, see *Kaf Ha'chaim* 123:17. One should not move from his place to get a *sefer* (*Avnei Yushfei* 4:10:1). If the *chazzan* is saying *peutim* then one may return to his place immediately after finishing his quiet *shemonei esrei*. (*Mishnah Berurah* 123:10).

³⁸ *Kaf Ha'chaim* 123:17.

³⁹ *Magen Avraham* 123:5, *Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham* 4, *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 18:13, *Kaf Ha'chaim Palagi* 15:58, *Mishnah Berurah* 6, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 123:11.

⁴⁰ 123:3. Refer to *Shar Ha'tzyion* 123:5.

⁴¹ Refer to footnote 37.

⁴² This is the custom of *Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita*.

⁴³ *Mishnah Berurah* 124:16, *Ishei Yisroel* 24:19.

The Short Chazaras Hashatz (Hoicha Kedusha)

During the time of the *Rambam* he did not allow the *chazaras hashatz* to be recited. In his time those people who knew how to *daven* would talk during *chazaras hashatz*, and the ones who were illiterate, followed in their ways, and did not listen to *chazaras hashatz* either. Therefore, the *Rambam* saw it fit to abolish the *chazaras hashatz*. He instituted that the *shliach tzibbur* begins reciting *shemonei esrei* immediately; those who were capable of *davening*, would *daven* quietly along with the *Shatz*, and the illiterate people would listen quietly, and answer *amen*.⁴⁴

The Different Types

There are various types of short *chazaras hashatz*'s. The *Shulchan Aruch*⁴⁵ says that one should say all of the quiet *shemonei esrei* and then the *shatz* says only until *hukel hakodesh*. The *Rama*⁴⁶ says the *tzibbur* should say word for word with the *shatz* until *hukel hakodesh*. The third way is the more popular way and that is that the *Shatz* says from the beginning of *davening*, in a loud voice, until *hukel hakodesh*, and then after *kedusha*, the *tzibbur* says their quiet *shemonei esrei*.⁴⁷

The Disadvantages Of The Short Chazaras Hashatz

When the short *chazaras hashatz* is recited the *tzibbur* misses out on answering many *amens*.⁴⁸ The *Gemorah* in *Berochos*⁴⁹ states the importance and greatness of reciting *amen*. The *shatz* is not supposed to say *Shemonei Esrei* in a loud voice, without first saying a quiet *Shemonei Esrei*.⁵⁰ The *chazaras hashatz* offers an opportunity for those coming in late to *shul*, and were unable to *daven tefilla b'tzibbur*, a chance to *daven* with the *shatz* word by word. This is preferable to *davening* alone.⁵¹

When Is It Permitted

The short version of *chazaras hashatz* should only be said in a pressing situation.⁵² Another situation is when there is doubt as to whether there will be ten men listening and answering *amen* to the entire *chazaras hashatz*.⁵³ When the *hoicha kedusha* is said, the *shliach tzibbur* avoids reciting many *berochos* in vain.

Abusing The Hoicha Kedusha

Many people think that whenever it is convenient for them to *daven* the short *chazaras hashatz*, they may do so, however, this is not the case. Many times at work people want a longer lunch break, so they want to recite a *hoicha kedusha*, this is not permissible.⁵⁴ The same is true for *mincha* when *davening* at a wedding,⁵⁵ or when counselors have their off day in camp, or *davening mincha* at an amusement park.

⁴⁴ *Teshuvos HaRambam* (Freeman) 37-38, pages 37-38, See *Bais Yosef* 234.

⁴⁵ 232:1. Refer to *Bais Yosef* 232, *Yalkut Yosef* page 279:3.

⁴⁶ 124:2, 232:1, Refer to *Darchei Moshe* 124:2.

⁴⁷ *Shulchan Hatohar* 124:3, 232:2, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 124:7, 232:6, see *Divrei Chamudos Berochos* 4:19.

⁴⁸ Refer to *Pela Yoetz (amen)* page 37-38.

⁴⁹ 53a, see *Gemorah Shabbos* 119a.

⁵⁰ *Magen Avraham* 124:3, see *Igros Moshe O.C.* 2:29, *Hamesivta* 5755:page 545.

⁵¹ Refer to *Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham* 52:1, 109:4, *Eishel Avraham Butchatch* 52, *Kaf Ha'chaim* 90:63, *Chazzon Ish O.C.* 19:4, *Salmas Chaim* 91(old), *Igros Moshe O.C.* 3:9, *Bais Borcu*h 1:19:footnote on 35:pages 111-112, *Teshuvos V'hanhugos* 1:100, *Moadim V'zmanim* 1:7, *Tefilla K'hilchosa* page 536, *Ishei Yisroel* 12:9.

⁵² *Shebuley Haleket* 47:page 20, *Magen Avraham* 124:3, *Be'er Heitiv* 124:4, *Shulchan Hatohar* 232:1-2, *Mishnah Berurah* 124:6, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 232:7, *Orchos Rabbeinu* 1:122:page 95. Refer to *Yechaveh Da'as* 3:16 who speaks strongly against the *hoicha kedusha*. See *Radvaz* 4:elef 162:pages 49-50.

⁵³ *Yechaveh Da'as* 3:16.

⁵⁴ *Hamesivta* 5755:pages 548-549, see *Jewish Observer* January 2001:page 27.

⁵⁵ *Kinyan Torah* 4:7.

The Custom Of Some Yeshivos Hakedoshim

There are some *Yeshivos Hakedoshim* who have the custom not to recite *chazaras hashatz*.⁵⁶ Many reasons are offered for this custom. Some say the reason is because *mincha* was scheduled for the middle of *seder* and if they would *daven mincha* with the entire *chazaras hashatz* then it would be considered *bitul torah*.⁵⁷ This reason is difficult to comprehend that for the reason of *bitul torah* one would forfeit the *chazaras hashatz*.⁵⁸ Others say the reason is because in earlier years the *shiur* was before *mincha*, and they were so deep in thought after the *shiur*, that they would not be able to concentrate on the *chazaras hashatz* properly. *Horav Yaakov Kamenetsky zt"l* explained the reason as follows: When *chazaras hashatz* was instituted it was only for a *bais hakenesses*, and not a *bais medrash*, since the *am huratzim* did not *daven* in the *bais medrash*, because they did not learn there. Therefore, today, we have *butei medrashim* where there are no *amei huratzim*, and there is no necessity for *chazaras hashatz*. This is the reason why some *Yeshivos Hakedoshim* do not say the full *chazaras hashatz* at *Mincha*.⁵⁹ Today, some *Yeshivos* do not have this custom anymore because *mincha* is usually recited after a long lunch break.⁶⁰ During *ben hazemanim* the *minhag* of the *Yeshivos* is to say the full *chazaras hashatz*.⁶¹ At *shacharis*, it is recited, because one has an obligation to be *so'meach geulah* to *tefilla*. If there would be a *hoicha kedusha* this would not be possible.⁶²

Davening In A Place That Says A Hoicha Kedusha

It would seem that if one does not say the *hoicha kedusha*, and he *davens* in a place that is lenient, and will be saying the *hoicha kedusha*, that he should not separate himself from the *tzibbur*, and he should join in with them.⁶³

On A Taanis/Chanukah

Even those who have the custom to recite the *hoicha kedusha* do not do this on a *tannis* or on *Chanukah*. The reason why it is not done on a fast day is in order that one can say *anneinu*.⁶⁴ The reason why it is not done on *Chanukah* is because the *Al Hanissim* is recited in *davening*.⁶⁵



⁵⁶ This custom started out in Europe. Refer to *Hamesivta* 5755:page 547.

⁵⁷ *Oz Nedberu* 12:23.

⁵⁸ *Hamesivta* 5755:pages 547-548.

⁵⁹ *Emes L'Yaakov* 124:footnote 152:page 69. *Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita* heard this *peshat* from *Horav Yaakov zt"l*.

⁶⁰ *Poskim*

⁶¹ *Poskim*

⁶² Refer to *Emes L'Yaakov* *ibid*, see *Biur Halacha* 124 "shyaver." *Horav Yisroel Belsky Shlita* explained that the *am huratzim* used to *daven* in the *bais medrash* by *shacharis* in order to hear a little *torah* after *daveing* before going to work. Therefore, *chazaras hashatz* was said at *shacharis*. (This *peshat* was heard from *Horav Yaakov Kamenetsky zt"l*).

⁶³ Refer to *Bunim Chavivim* pages 342-343.

⁶⁴ *Magen Avraham* 232:2, *Be'er Heitiv* 232:1, *Aruch Ha'shulchan* 232:4-6.

⁶⁵ *Moadm V'zemanim* 8:page 106.

If you wish to receive Halachically Speaking via email for a nominal fee please

send your email address to

mdl@thehalacha.com

© Copyright 2006 Moishe Dovid Lebovits

For Weekly Sponsorship Opportunities Please Call 718-744-4360